Making the Most of Early Learning Settings: Ensuring Quality for the Classroom and Home Visiting

Mark S. Innocenti, Ph.D.
Utah State University

National Conference of State Legislators
Early Learning Fellows
Building on State Leadership in Early Childhood
Washington, DC
December 7, 2013
Acknowledgements

• Lori Roggman, PhD
• Gina Cook, PhD
• Colleagues on projects where measures to be discussed were developed
• Participating program staff and families

• Conflict of interest: Yes, PICCOLO is published

What is home visiting?

• Voluntary services provided in the family home
  – matches parents with trained professionals
  – provide information and support
    • during pregnancy
    • throughout their child’s earliest years

PEW Home Visiting Campaign website
Is there support for home visiting?

- Yes!
- Reviews of research
  - Kahn & Moore, 2010; Paulsell et al., 2010; Sweet & Applebaum, 2004;
- Business community
  - U.S. Chamber of Commerce, Institute for a Competitive Workforce, 2010; ReadyNation.org; Upjohn Institute (Bartik, 2011); Minneapolis Federal Reserve (Grunewald & Rolnick)
- Policy
  - Maternal, Infant, and Early Childhood Home Visiting (MIECHV) Program; Strong Start for America’s Children Act (Bipartisan proposal to expand high quality early education)

Is all home visiting the same?

- Home visiting indicates the place not the intervention
- Different program foci, intervention nuances, outcomes
  - Home Visiting Evidence of Effectiveness (HomVEE) review (Paulsell et al., 2010)
  - HomVEE identified 8 outcome areas
  - MIECHV identifies 6 benchmarks
- Child development and parenting practices most frequently identified positive outcomes (HomVEE)
  - Support for pre and postnatal health outcomes (Pediatrics, v. 132, November 2013; Nurse Family Partnership)
Is all home visiting effective?

- Varying outcomes for *evidence-based* home visiting models (Azzi-Lessing, 2011; Paulsell et al., 2010)
- Outcome variability attributed to dosage, home visitor characteristics, family risk factors (Azzi-Lessing, 2011)

How can we make improve home visiting effectiveness?

- If our outcomes are improved parenting and facilitating child development ....
- Focus on
  - Parenting to mediate the child outcomes
  - Child development
- Developmental parenting
What is developmental parenting?

• A research–based approach to home visiting
  – Not a program or a curriculum
• Strategies to engage parents in supporting their children’s development
• A strengths-based approach characterized by:
  – Parent-child interaction during most of the visit (> 50%)
  – Positive feedback on developmental parenting behaviors
  – Family materials and activities used for home visits

Roggman, Boyce, & Innocenti, 2008

Research Support for DP Approach

Early Head Start home visiting program for low-income families (compared with a randomly assigned comparison group):

Indirect path: focus -> engagement -> parenting, Sobel = 2.39, p = .02
Indirect path: engagement -> parenting -> child development, Sobel = 2.32, p = .03
Research Support for **DP** Approach

Indirect path: focused engagement -> parenting -> child development, \( Sobel = 2.40, p = .02 \)

(Innocenti & Roggman, 2012; Roggman et al., 2002, 2009, 2010; Roggman & Cook, 2011; Roggman, unpublished)

---

What is the take away message from DP research?

- Engaging parents in home visits focused on child development provides both direct & indirect pathways to positive child outcomes

- Other supporting research
  - Parenting direct and mediational role (ACF, 2002; Dunst & Trivette, 2009; Trivette et al., 2010).
  - Parenting at ages 1,2, and 3, predictive of 5th grade academic skills (Innocenti et al., 2013)
How do we improve outcomes and ensure home visiting quality?

To improve programs:
Measure the components
What will facilitate improved outcomes and ensure home visiting quality?

• Observational measure of home visitor practices and parent engagement

• Valid and useful measure of parent-child interaction
Home Visit Rating Scales (HOVRS)
Measure of Home Visiting


What does HOVRS measure?

Home Visit Rating Scales (HOVRS)
- observational measure
- multiple quality indicators
- reliable: agreement > 85%
- valid: predicts positive parent & child outcomes
Research-Based Home Visiting – HOVRS Scales

1. **Relationship**: Show warmth, respect, acceptance
2. **Responsiveness**: Respond to family strengths
3. **Facilitation**: Elicit parent-child interaction
4. **Non-Intrusiveness**: Work with parent to focus on child
5. **Parent-Child Interaction**: warmth, responsiveness, support
6. **Parent engagement**: proximity, activity, interaction, initiation
7. **Child engagement**: proximity, activity, interaction, initiation


If you want to . . .

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Use this <strong>HOVRS Strategy</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Promote trust</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Engage the whole family</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Increase positive interactions</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Use family activities</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Promote developmental parenting</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Improve support of child development</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Build parent capacity</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Support parent in parenting role</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>See if strategies are working</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>See of a family needs more support</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>See if a particular visit was effective</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Relationship with family</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Responsiveness to family strengths</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Facilitation of parent-child interaction</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Non-intrusiveness (collaboration)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Parent &amp; Child Interaction &amp; Engagement</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Why use HOVRS?

- Guides observation
- Provides home visitors with specific feedback
  - Coaching/supervision
- Identifies home visitor training needs
- Identifies goals for home visiting program improvement
- What’s valued gets measured, and what’s measured gets done!

HOVRS is recommended

  - http://www.mdrc.org/dohve-project-resources
- Parents as Teachers (2013). Quality assurance guidelines for parents as teachers affiliates. Parents as Teachers.
**Do HOVRS strategies work? (is it valid?)**

- Yes, HOVRS strategies in 2 programs (Utah & Iowa) predicted major outcomes of Early Head Start at age 3

![Graph showing comparison between high and low HOVRS strategies](image)

- *Parenting*—HOME
- *Child Language Development*—PPVT

---

**What will facilitate improved outcomes and ensure home visiting quality?**

- Observational measure of home visitor practices and parent engagement

- Valid and useful measure of parent-child interaction
Parenting Interactions with Children: Checklist of Observations Linked to Outcomes


Parenting Interactions with Children: Checklist of Observations Linked to Outcomes

• Observational measure of developmental parenting
  - with children age 1-3, with or without disabilities
• Psychometrically strong
• Guide process; evaluate program
• Practical for programs
  - Easy to learn and use
  - 4 parenting domains, 7 or 8 items per domain
  - 10 minutes to administer
How was **PICCOLO** developed?

Data & video from the *Early Head Start Research & Evaluation Project*

New observations of over 4,500 video clips from over 2,000 families in 17 communities across the US.

29 best items from over 100 items

- inter-rater reliability
- internal consistency
- single factor structure in domains
- construct validity
- predictive validity

What does **PICCOLO** measure?

**Affection:** Warmth, closeness, positive emotions

**Responsiveness:** Responds to cues, communication

**Encouragement:** Support of interest & effort

**Teaching:** Conversation, play, cognitive stimulation

(Bornstein et al., 1998; Caspi et al., 2004; Dickinson et al., 2003; Dodici et al., 2003; Estrada et al., 1987; Gardner et al., 2003; Hirsh-Pasik & Burchinal, 2006; Perry, 2002; Petrill & Deater-Deckard, 2004; Roggman et al., 2004; Snow, et al., 1998; van den Boom, 1994)
**PICCOLO cultural considerations**

**PICCOLO** was tested in 3 ethnic/cultural groups:
- European American
- African American
- Latino American

**PICCOLO** observers of multiple ethnicities observed within and across ethnicity of families on video clips.

**PICCOLO** is reliable and valid within each group.

---

**PICCOLO is . . .**

**Reliable:**
Independent observers rate **PICCOLO** items similarly,
- average 77% agreement
- scores correlated between observers, $r > .77$
- 2 of 3 observers agree 90% of the time

and **PICCOLO** domain items “hang together”
- domains are internally consistent, alpha > .70
- single factor structure within each domain
PICCOLO is . . .

Valid:

- **content validity**: practitioners rate the behaviors as important
- **construct validity**: domains are correlated with similar measures
- **predictive validity**: domains predict children’s cognitive skills, vocabulary, emergent literacy, emotion-regulation, and social behavior
  -- at 3 years of age, at kindergarten entry, at 5th grade

Why use **PICCOLO**?

**PICCOLO** identifies parenting behaviors that support early child development.

**PICCOLO** shows what parents are comfortable doing and think is important to do.

**PICCOLO** can help early childhood practitioners provide encouraging feedback about positive parenting.
29 things parents do that support development

1. Speak warmly
2. Smile at child
3. Praise child
4. Stay physically close to child
5. Say positive things to child
6. Interact in positive ways with child
7. Show emotional warmth
8. Pay attention to what child is doing
9. Change activities to meet child’s interests or needs
10. Be flexible when child changes interests
11. Follow what child is trying to do
12. Respond to child’s emotions
13. Look at child when child talks or makes sounds
14. Reply to child’s words or sounds
15. Wait for child’s response after making a suggestion
16. Encourage child to do things with toys
17. Support child’s choices
18. Help child do things on his or her own
19. Verbally encourage child’s efforts
20. Offer suggestions to help child
21. Show enthusiasm about what child does
22. Explain reasons for something to child
23. Suggest activities to build on what child is doing
24. Repeat or expand child’s words or sounds
25. Label objects or actions for child
26. Engage in pretend play with child
27. Do activities in a sequence of steps
28. Talk about characteristics of objects
29. Ask child for information

What are the “take home” messages?

• Goal of home visiting programs can vary
• Need to be able to measure the components and use the information to improve practice
• What happens during the home visit - the behavior of the practitioner, parent, child - needs to be measured
  – HOVRS does this
• Parenting plays a major role for improving child development outcomes – now and later
  – PICCOLO allows us to directly observe parenting
Thank you!

Mark.Innocenti@usu.edu