

Redistricting Plan Success Rates

Legislatures vs. Commissions

	House	Senate	Congress
2010s			
Legislatures	80% (24 of 30)	81% (25 of 31)	86% (23 of 29)
Commissions	64% (9 of 14)	64% (9 of 14)	100% (6 of 6)
2000s			
Legislatures	68% (23 of 34)	77% (27 of 35)	74% (28 of 38)
Commissions	71% (10 of 14)	71% (10 of 14)	100% (5 of 5)
1990s			
Legislatures	57% (21 of 37)	62% (23 of 37)	59% (23 of 39)
Commissions	80% (8 of 10)	91% (10 of 11)	100% (4 of 4)
1980s			
Legislatures	66% (25 of 38)	62% (24 of 39)	
Commissions	67% (6 of 9)	67% (6 of 9)	
1970s			
Legislatures	67% (26 of 39)	63% (25 of 40)	
Commissions	63% (5 of 8)	75% (6 of 8)	

Success: As used in this table, “success” means that a plan was either not challenged in court or, if challenged, was upheld without change.

Note: The totals do not add to 50 because Nebraska does not have a house, two states (Alaska and Maryland) had the governor draw legislative plans from the 1970s to the 1990s, seven states have only one congressional seat, and litigation on the 2010 plans is not complete. Alaska adopted a constitutional amendment in 1998 moving the redistricting power from the governor to a commission.

Source: NCSL study of the 1970s and 1980s, completed in November 1990 but not published; *Action on Redistricting Plans: 1991-99*, by Peter S. Wattson (Aug. 8, 2017) [*****.ncsl.org/Portals/1/Documents/Elections/action_91-99_31520.pdf](http://www.ncsl.org/Portals/1/Documents/Elections/action_91-99_31520.pdf); *Action on Redistricting Plans: 2001-07*, Peter S. Wattson (Aug. 8, 2017)

[*****.ncsl.org/Portals/1/Documents/Elections/action_00_31520.pdf](http://www.ncsl.org/Portals/1/Documents/Elections/action_00_31520.pdf);

Action on Redistricting Plans: 2011-20, Peter S. Wattson (Nov. 24, 2020)

[*****.ncsl.org/Portals/1/Documents/Elections/action2010-2_31520.pdf](http://www.ncsl.org/Portals/1/Documents/Elections/action2010-2_31520.pdf).



[Go to NCSL Redistricting home page](#)

This page is maintained by the Elections and Redistricting Committee for the National Conference of State Legislatures

Update: November 24, 2020 at 8:54 pm (psw)

Comments: peterwattson@gmail.com