Overview

I. Incorporating Evidence
II. Revision
III. Peer-Editing
I. Incorporating Evidence

- Primary Sources
- Secondary Sources
- General Principles
Primary Sources

• Support your points
• Enliven the text
The next volley in the war against margarine was an all-out propaganda campaign. The dairy industry put out various publications designed to incite the public against margarine. One article called margarine “the slag of the butchershop...a compound of diseased hogs and dead dogs.” Other reports claimed that margarine “contained the germs of cancer” and caused insanity. Political cartoons featured lurid depictions of margarine factories, showing margarine being made out of stray cats, soap, paint, arsenic, old boots and hats, animal intestines, wool, and sheep heads.58
Shortly after German representatives signed an agreement to cease fighting at precisely 11:11 AM on November 11, 1918, telegrams announcing the Armistice zipped across the Atlantic, reaching the Midwest in the middle of the night. But its late night arrival did not stop the news from causing a stir. In Madison, hundreds emerged from their homes for a spontaneous “nightly procession” that lasted until daybreak. A report in the *Capital Times* depicted it as a parade of sorts, with “Tin pans, tea kettles, old dish pans tied on the back of automobiles, girls hanging on every available perch of every car on the streets, flags galore, noise more than galore,” and some still sporting their pajamas […] Across the state, Wisconsinites expressed collective euphoria, bursting through the silence of night with joyous, unrestrained noise.
January 7, 1856, a bitterly cold inauguration day, arrived. In a full public ceremony and a display of military force, Barstow was sworn in for a second term as governor. Barstow’s 258 militiamen escorted him from the governor’s residence, “marching from the train depot to Governor Barstow’s residence, where the State officers elect, together with Mr. Barstow…joined the procession and proceeded to the capitol.” According to the Madison Wisconsin Daily State Journal, published the day after Barstow’s inauguration, the air was so cold that the “whiskers of the [militia] men were white with frost.” Among the festivities, the legislative halls and state offices were open during the day and evening for “musing, promenading, and dancing” and a “military review…with cannon, martial music and other appropriate exercises.” This friendly portrayal represented yet another political machine at Barstow’s disposal.
In a radically different take of the inaugural festivities, according to the *Daily Wisconsin Patriot* for January 9, 1856, the militiamen were only interested in Barstow’s celebratory lager. The “thirsty” troops “struggle[ed] through town…the most military of their motions being the vigorous rubbing of their ears.” Once they reached the capitol, the militiamen “charged the governor’s lager – and took it, while he took the oath of office, amid the petty roar of miniature canon [fire].” The reporter added that “after copious drains upon the lager the company slid down stairs on the bannisters.” All this bickering testified to the essential role that the press played in supporting and opposing party politics.
Secondary Source

- Support your points
- Demonstrate the breadth of your research
The idea that the French sailors primarily pushed the Revolution movement is discussed heavily by a few scholars on the subject, but most thoroughly by University of Kentucky historian and professor Jeremy D. Popkin. Popkin says, "The nautical uprising of 20 June 1793 in Cap François, Saint-Domingue’s largest city, set off a chain of events that would lead, on 4 February 1794, to the French National Convention’s historic decree abolishing slavery throughout the French empire. Although this was not an outcome the sailors had sought, it can truly be said that, without their intervention, it is unlikely that the slave emancipations of 1793 in Saint-Domingue and 1794 in France would have taken place." This quote sets the tone for Popkin’s argument that the mutiny among the sailors had a massive impact on how and when the following events took place, even stating that it is unlikely that it would’ve happened any time close to that.

The other theory among scholars about causes and catalysts to the abolition of slavery, though not as popular as the sailor’s uprising approach, is the theory that the marooning slaves

---

As one of only a few utopian communities founded in Wisconsin, Ceresco has received a fair amount of attention from the contemporary public and historians alike. 

But the mystery of Ceresco’s demise is what has sparked most of the curiosity in Ceresco’s historians. Generally they frame their studies by asking the question, “Why did Ceresco fail?” A variety of reasons are asserted: a general “lassitude and indifference in moral religious matters” that encouraged community disintegration; its nearest neighbor, Ripon, “became a dangerous rival, that finally absorbed the earlier community; its “cooperative plan of ownership and of production—especially unitary labor,” did not mesh with the American sentiment for private ownership; and finally, the poor economy that drove many into the community improved enough to allow for a comfortable exit.\(^5\)

General Principles

• Voice
• Argument
• Balance
Example #1
Other sources underscore women’s symbolic role in the Aztec world. Anthropologist Ross Hassig of University of Oklahoma writes that to expand their empire, the Aztecs relied on social control—particularly of and through women—as much as territorial conquest.25 Scholars June Nash and Karen Viera Powers also emphasize how rulers asserted control over neighboring tribes through polygamy and forced marriage of conquered women.26 Along similar lines, Rita Wright draws attention to the ways that their material culture depicted women’s mutilated body parts to “[represent] the Aztec state’s subjugation of its enemies.”27 Furthermore, firsthand accounts like the Codex describe how rulers demonstrated their largesse to leaders of conquered peoples with gifts of “capes, beds, wealth, women, and [slaves].”28 Such an exchange demonstrated the importance of women as symbols of conquest.29
Example #2
Even while assisting veterans, the board counseled them against becoming dependent on such assistance. A letter from the Service Recognition Fund to Oscar Dettmeyer emphasized this fact, noting that the former soldier’s $30 monthly allowance was “temporary only and should in no manner be considered as a pension.”

This approach borrowed from rehabilitation theories that advocated for stirring injured men into self-sufficiency rather than treating them as objects of charity. According to one federal brochure from 1918, the latter course would only render the veteran “a cripple with the pity of the world” rather than a “self-supporting” and “self-respecting” breadwinner. As scholar Beth Linker explains, “manliness could (and would) not be achieved until a disabled veteran reentered the workforce.” Key to this outcome was ensuring that men did not rely on state disability funds.

1 Wisconsin Historical Society Archives, Series 1567: Disabled soldiers correspondence, 1919-1923. Box 1, case #17 (Oscar Dettmeyer).
2 A major proponent of these theories was Elizabeth G. Upham. A pioneer in occupational theory working at Milwaukee-Downer College, Upham was summoned from Wisconsin to Washington by the Federal Board for Vocational Education during the war. See Elizabeth G. Upham, Desirability of vocational education and direction for disabled soldiers (Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Extension Service, September 1917); Jacqueline I.
Example #3
“While Democratic Governor William A. Barstow appeared to win reelection in 1855, this proved to be an illusion, as evidence of considerable corruption came to light.”

Disputed elections are nothing new to American politics. The nation’s first major electoral disputes—ones in which one party believed that it had been robbed because the opposing party abused the state’s counting procedures—arose in New York and Massachusetts at the turn of the nineteenth century.\(^1\) Fueled by anger at even the perception of electoral theft, the opposing parties erupted in dispute and bloodshed because nascent state governments lacked an institutional framework capable of handling these controversies.\(^2\) However, Wisconsin’s 1855 gubernatorial election produced *Bashford v. Barstow*, a striking precedent for how to protect the electorate’s democratic choice through the rule of law.\(^3\) Republican Coles Bashford challenged William A. Barstow, the Democratic incumbent. Amidst allegations of fraud and forgeries, and a providential shower of supplementary returns, the State Board of Canvassers determined that Barstow won by a plurality of 157 votes.\(^4\) With a letter directly addressed to Barstow a few days after his inauguration, an anonymous author provided their opinion of the events, stating “the impunity with which you trample upon constituents, laws, and precedents would date your history contemporaneous with Caligula.”\(^5\)

---

1. In New York, George Clinton won the first five gubernatorial elections until 1792 when he was challenged by John Jay. Jay’s defeat triggered the nation’s first vote-counting dispute (in a statewide race). In Massachusetts, in 1806, James Sullivan challenged incumbent Caleb Strong and with fewer than 200 votes in the balance—local ballots were scrutinized in a partisan manner.

2. The best example of political violence was Pennsylvania’s gubernatorial election of 1838, known as the “Buckshot War,” when an outbreak of civil unrest swept Harrisburg, Pennsylvania.


4. 36,355 to 36,198.

II. Revision
General Revision Strategies

• Take some time between writing and revision
• Read the draft out loud and out of order
• Don’t sweat the small stuff
The Reverse Outline

Go through your existing draft and try to decipher the main point of each paragraph in a succinct statement or phrase.
List those in the form of an outline, and then consider the following:
A. Argument
B. Repetition
C. Sequence
The Reverse Outline, continued

Next, use the outline to reexamine each paragraph in depth:
A. Is there one main point? Multiple? None?
B. Does every source detail support the main point?
Reverse Outline Example
Worse, the most potent accusations of disloyalty came from within the state. Self-styled patriots filled the ranks of the fiercely pro-war Wisconsin Defense League, which hurled harsh accusations at public figures and private citizens alike. In one particularly incendiary speech during an August 1917 gathering, one member argued that seditious men “should be shot down or hanged to the first lamp post.” Only occasionally did words like these escalate into outright violence, as in several isolated incidents wherein masked men tarred and feathered unsuspecting targets, sometimes other European immigrants mistaken for being German.

More commonly, people pressured members of their community to purchase Liberty Bonds as proof of their commitment to the war effort. Concerned citizens also reported neighbors and acquaintances whom they suspected of disloyalty. The State Council of Defense fielded many such accusations, but more often than not, petty personal grievances motivated these formal complaints. The Council ultimately reminded the accusers that only “FACT and NOT HEARSAY” would prompt official investigation.
Veterans policy was on the backburner in early 1919. Veterans featured only marginally on the governor’s list of priorities, and their concerns soon became lost in a sea of legislative proposals. Early reports forecast that an unprecedented number of bills would be introduced that session on a vast array of issues. The Capital Times confirmed these predictions, announcing in mid-February that an “avalanche” of legislation was in play – about 200 bills, many of which pertained to labor relations and railroads. By then, the legislature had already received a formal report of the Special Legislative Committee on Reconstruction, tasked with devising “a comprehensive social and economic welfare program of Reconstruction after the war.” This report touched on a wide range of issues, including collective bargaining, farming cooperatives, rural schools, roads, the eight-hour workday, and women in the workplace. But soldiers seemed only to be an afterthought, meriting only a brief mention in one paragraph about potential land settlement schemes.

How had veterans’ policy slipped so far down the list of policy makers’ concerns? An editorial published months later in the Wisconsin State Journal pointed blame in one direction: “Political jealousies have been batted about like ping pong balls,” the author complained, “and
III. Peer-Editing

- Writer’s Perspective
- Peer-Editor’s Perspective
Writer’s Perspective
Example of writer’s notes to reviewer

- **Organization.** There is some jumping around in time, for ex., when I address efforts to welcome servicemen from Feb. 1919 through the summer of 1919; later, when I move on to other policies, I jump back to Feb. again, which may be confusing. But I’m not sure how to avoid that.

- **Content.** I’m over the word limit and should cut. What info can go? What info would work better as a sidebar?

- **Ideas.** Were you convinced that the legislation passed in 1919 was important?
Example of Writer’s Rubric

Create a rubric that addresses the following:
• Organization
• Evidence
• Ideas
• Style

Ask the reader to identify:
• Three strong points
• Three areas of improvement
Peer-Editor’s Perspective
Civil War

The Civil War wrought suffering on an unprecedented scale as a conflict of unmatched size, scope, and duration. Historian Drew Gilpin Faust estimates 620,000 lives lost, amounting to a 2 percent fatality rate nationwide. Thousands more returned home with scarred faces, lost limbs, or poor health. These men, their families, and American society at large had suffered “an authentic tragedy of individual and collective proportions,” as David Blight puts it. This tragedy trained American attention toward veterans; how would government rehabilitate these men and, by extension, the nation itself?

As early as 1862, federal laws provided pensions for men with disabilities “incurred as a direct consequence of [...] military duty.” But a broader plan addressing all Union soldiers would not begin to take shape until the 1870s. By then, wider political dynamics ensured that these men would not be forgotten, even as the war receded into memory. Republican politicians designated

---

Example of rubric comments

**Three strengths**

1) Level of detail in evidence and examples (both primary and secondary) – specifically the primary sources because that information will most likely not be present in any other VB narratives (the examples pertaining to WI veterans)

2) Variation of sources

3) Sentence variation – construction style and length
Example of rubric comments

Three areas of improvement

1) Tighter organization – I think by rethinking possible ways to present the information will aid in the reader’s grasp of the narrative arc of the piece

2) Clearer acknowledgement when discussing federal vs. state level benefits (by addressing #1’s tighter organization)

3) Add in basic details (can be relegated to a footnote) for readers unacquainted with American war history or those readers that might need a bit of a refresh
Overview

I. Incorporating Evidence
II. Revision
III. Peer-Editing